

ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

---

COMMITTEE : **Environment, Planning and Infrastructure**

DATE: **31<sup>st</sup> January 2012**

DIRECTOR: **Gordon McIntosh**

TITLE OF REPORT: **Report following Councillor Yuill's motion at the September 2011 E, P and I Committee to introduce restrictions that would prevent heavy or large goods vehicles from using Broomhill Road as a through route.**

REPORT NUMBER: **EPI/11/285**

---

**1. PURPOSE OF REPORT**

This report responds to Councillor Yuill's notice of motion "That given the ongoing difficulties caused by HGVs using Broomhill Road as a through route, Council instructs officers to report to the appropriate committee on the introduction of an "except for access" weight or width restriction on some or all of Broomhill Road between Holburn Street and South Anderson Drive."

**2. RECOMMENDATION(S)**

It is recommended that given the strategic importance of Broomhill Road within the road network and hierarchy the Committee agree that a weight or width restriction would not be appropriate.

**3. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no implications for the recommendation above however the introduction of advance warning signs and illuminated signs covering the affected roads leading to Broomhill Road would be in the region of £30,000

**4. OTHER IMPLICATIONS**

Implementing a restriction of this magnitude over a road of this importance will have significant implications for Transport Scotland and their ability to manage the trunk road traffic management under major emergency conditions.

It is likely that they will put forward a strong objection to this proposal.

## 5. BACKGROUND/MAIN ISSUES

- 5.1 At the meeting of this Committee on 13<sup>th</sup> September 2011 a motion from Councillor Yuill was considered:

“That given the ongoing difficulties caused by HGVs using Broomhill Road as a through route, Council instructs officers to report to the appropriate committee on the introduction of an ‘except for access’ weight or width restriction on some or all of Broomhill Road between Holburn Street and South Anderson Drive”

This committee subsequently instructed officers to report on the terms of the motion to a future meeting of the Enterprise, Planning and Infrastructure Committee.

- 5.2 Over the years there have been a number of residential complaints and inquiries regarding the number of Heavy Goods Vehicles (HGVs) using Broomhill Road and the possibility of limiting their access.
- 5.3 Surveys carried out in the past have shown that there is a relatively high usage of Broomhill Road by HGVs but that this is restricted mainly to the peak flow hours. Although this usage was at the higher end of the desired level, the percentage of HGVs has always been below or around this pre-determined level.
- 5.4 Broomhill Road is a district distributor road leading in to the city from the south-west serving a large residential area, but also providing access to numerous commercial and retail properties along its length. These retail premises require regular deliveries, some of which require HGV access ie vehicles over 11.5m in length. Although these vehicles would still be eligible to access these premises under the ‘except for access’ exemption, they will also form a significant proportion of the HGVs recorded in the surveys detailed in the table below.
- 5.5 The following table gives an indication of the volume of traffic currently using this road during the week (excluding week-ends) with the number and percentage of HGVs over 11.5m also recorded. These surveys were carried out in November of this year. They are representative of a normal working week and provide a clear indication of the strategic importance of this route.

<b>Number of vehicles: 7:00am to 7:00pm daily</b>					
	<b>Total vehicle numbers (inc HGVs)</b>				
	<b>Eastbound</b>	<b>Westbound</b>	<b>Combined</b>	<b>No of HGVs combined</b>	<b>(%) HGVs</b>
<b>Mon</b>	3524	3042	<b>6566</b>	203	3.1
<b>Tues</b>	3830	2995	<b>6825</b>	262	3.8
<b>Wed</b>	No data available				
<b>Thurs</b>	3919	3100	<b>7019</b>	264	3.8
<b>Fri</b>	4191	3255	<b>7446</b>	395	5.3

- 5.6 Broomhill Road also forms part of the No 1 and 2 bus routes which travel from the City Centre and extends beyond the Robert Gordon University in Garthdee to Auchinyell Road. It caters for a large number of students attending the University as well as residents within the area. This service runs every 12 minutes throughout the peak travel times, on average 12 vehicles an hour. These buses, although exempt from the proposed restriction, form a significant percentage (50% - 80% dependent on the time of day) of the recorded HGVs in the above table.
- 5.7 This road also has an important part to play in the recently formed strategic emergency traffic management plan, **“Major Incident - Anderson Drive - Diversion Plan”**. This plan results from work carried out with the emergency services, and Bear (Scotland) to identify diversion routes during major incidents on the A90(T), (North of the Bridge of Dee). These routes are required to ensure the free flow of traffic should the A90(T) be closed at any point along its length.
- 5.8 Broomhill Road forms a part of a number of these diversion routes and as such will be required to take HGVs from the A90, possibly in both directions, if an incident on this scale occurs.
- 5.9 There are a number of vehicles currently using the Broomhill Road, Great Southern Road route south during the evening peak hours as a legitimate alternative route to avoid the congestion at the South Anderson Drive / Holburn Street / Garthdee Road roundabout. Of these vehicles, a percentage are HGVs, however, the numbers are relatively low in comparison to the total number of HGVs taking access to Broomhill Road to serve local premises.
- 5.10 It would be prudent to highlight the issues surrounding enforcement of a weight/width restriction. These are restrictions that can only be enforced by Grampian Police and only through a police presence. There are no reasonable means of self-enforcement. For such restrictions to be adhered to would require a considerable investment of police resources and failure to adequately enforce would render the restriction ineffective and contribute to bringing these types of restrictions into disrepute.
- 5.11 As with similar restrictions elsewhere in the city, restricting HGV access along one street results in these vehicles choosing alternative routes. It would be comforting to think that drivers would automatically revert to using the trunk road and join the existing queue from the Holburn Street/South Anderson Drive/Garthdee Road roundabout and accept the extended journey time. The reality, however, is likely to be different and would be counter-productive if these drivers then choose to use a less suitable road in a further attempt to reduce journey times.

- 5.12 The diversion of HGVs to other routes will add to the congestion experienced and increase delays to all traffic putting pressure on all vehicles to seek alternative via residential streets.
- 5.13 This issue of HGV restriction stems mainly from the desire of drivers, (in particular HGV drivers), to avoid traffic congestion at the Holburn Street/South Anderson Drive/Garthdee Road roundabout. It is worth noting that the traffic modeling, carried out as part of the assessment of the Western Peripheral Route, suggests a substantial reduction in the volume of traffic using the A90 and in turn the congestion at this roundabout. With reduced congestion then it is reasonable to expect that there will be less need to find alternative routes whilst travelling south.
- 5.14 In summary, Broomhill Road plays a major role in the hierarchy of the roads network in Aberdeen. It serves as a major link to the retail and commercial section in the centre of the city and as such is required take an appropriate level of HGV traffic. A major restriction such as this will also have far-reaching effects on the surrounding road network
- 5.15 Taking the above into consideration, it is recommended that no further action is taken with regard to either weight or width restrictions on Broomhill Road

## **6. IMPACT**

- 6.1 The content of the report meets with the local Community Plan objectives to continually improve road safety and maximize accessibility for all modes of transport

## **7. BACKGROUND PAPERS**

N/A

## **8. REPORT AUTHOR DETAILS**

Ruth Milne  
Technical Officer,  
[rumilne@aberdeencity.gov.uk](mailto:rumilne@aberdeencity.gov.uk)  
(01224) 538052

## Consultees comments

<b>Council Leader</b>	Councillor Callum McCaig – has been consulted
<b>Convenor</b>	Councillor Kate Dean – has been consulted
<b>Vice Convenor</b>	Councillor John Corall – has been consulted

<u>Local Members</u>	email 23/12/2011
<b>Councillor George Adam</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Yvonne Allan</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Marie Boulton</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Bill Cormie (Depute Provost)</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Barney Crocket</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Martin Greig</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Muriel Jaffrey</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Alan Milne</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor George Penny</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor Richard Robertson</b>	Has been consulted
<b>Councillor John West</b>	Has been consulted
Councillor John Stewart	Has been consulted
Councillor Kevin Stewart	Has been consulted
Councillor Jillian Wisely	Has been consulted
Councillor Ian Yuill	<i>Has been consulted and does not agree with the recommendations. He remains of the view that a weight or width restriction should be introduced on some or all of Broomhill Road between Holburn Street and South Anderson Drive.</i>
Councillor Irene Cormack	<i>Has been consulted and has no comments</i>
Councillor Alan Donnelly	Has been consulted
Councillor James Kiddie	Has been consulted
Councillor Neil Cooney	Has been consulted
Councillor Mark McDonald	Has been consulted
Councillor Jennifer Laing	Has been consulted
Councillor Len Ironside	Has been consulted
Lord Provost Peter Stephen	Has been consulted
Councillor Wendy Stuart	Has been consulted
Councillor Gordon Townson	Has been consulted
Councillor Neil Fletcher	Has been consulted
Councillor Kirsty West	Has been consulted
Councillor Aileen Malone	Has been consulted
Councillor Neil MacGregor	Has been consulted
Councillor Jackie Dunbar	Has been consulted
Councillor Gordon Graham	Has been consulted
Councillor Andrew May	Has been consulted
Councillor James Hunter	Has been consulted
Councillor Norman Collie	Has been consulted
Councillor Jim Noble	Has been consulted
Councillor Gordon Leslie	Has been consulted
Councillor John Reynolds	Has been consulted
Councillor Jim Farquharson	Has been consulted
Councillor Jennifer Stewart	Has been consulted
Councillor Willie Young	Has been consulted

---

---

## **Council Officers**

---

Barry Jenkins, Head of Finance, Resources – *has been consulted and has no comments*

Jane MacEachran, City Solicitor, Continuous Improvement - has been consulted

Ciaran Monaghan, Head of Service, Office of Chief Executive - has been consulted

Gordon McIntosh, Director of Enterprise, Planning and Infrastructure - *is in agreement with the recommendations of this report.*

Hugh Murdoch, Head of Service, Shelter and Environment – *has been consulted and made minor alterations.*

Margaret Bochel, Head of Planning & Infrastructure, Strategic Leadership – *has been consulted and is in agreement with the recommendations within this report.*

Mike Cheyne, Roads Manager - has been consulted

Neil Carnegie, Community Safety Manager - has been consulted

Dave Young, Account Manager, Service, Design and Development - has been consulted

Kathryn McFarlane, Service Co-ordinator

Allison Swanson, Committee Services

---

---